DLF Forum Opening Plenary and Keynote
“Beautiful Data: Justice, Code, and Architectures of the Sublime”
October 14, 2019

Speakers and Description:
-Marisa Duarte

Please join us for the opening plenary for the 2019 DLF Forum. After brief welcome and logistical remarks, we will enjoy a keynote talk by Dr. Marisa Duarte, entitled "Beautiful Data: Justice, Code, and Architectures of the Sublime."
If library and information science has an aesthetic it might manifest in the precision and orderliness of clean, appropriately labeled data. The more seamless our systems are, the less likely the user is to need us at every turn. She will have the freedom to effectively navigate the systems we build as she searches for the documents that, we hope, will relieve cognitive dissonance, satisfy a need to know, and inspire an unencumbered intellectual drive. Yet social changes in the US relating to race and surveillance, algorithmic discrimination, loss of privacy, and hate speech online is showing us that beautiful data is perhaps more of a mirage than a reality. Understanding the relationship between data and justice also helps us understand the role of digital libraries as institutions for change, and teaches us about the radical serenity of librarianship.

Charles Henry:	00:00:00	Welcome to the 2019 DLF Forum in sparkling Tampa, Florida. And, we are grateful for you to be here today. The program this year is, it's, as usual, rich, diverse, and I think compelling and we will look forward to those events unfolding over the next couple of days. I'm Chuck Henry, president of CLIR and I will be doing sort of some introductory remarks briefly this morning. The first order of business, however, is a land acknowledgement. And I would like to introduce to you Herbert Jim from the Seminole tribe of Florida. Herbert.
Herbert Jim:	00:00:57	Good morning. (speaking Mikisúkî language)
Herbert Jim:	00:01:35	And what I was just saying is welcome here. When people come and they visit with us, you know, we welcome to our land, welcome to our territory. The way we used to do it in our traditional ways is they would send a runner and he would come to the gates and he would come to the edge of our villages. And he would sit there and wait at the gate until somebody acknowledged him. A young child would run to the elders and tell them, you know, well, there's a man over there waiting by the gate. And then they'll send somebody in order to go get that man and bring him to the village.

Herbert Jim:	00:02:26	And the center of the village is where our cooking chickee is. That's where the women gather, but on the side of it, there was a chickee there where all the men would gather and eat. So, he would be brought there, and he was told, you know, okay, you can put your stuff here, you can take your jacket off. You want to wash your face, you want to wash your hands, you want to wash your feet and we'll bring you water. And they would bring him water and take care of him. And he would sit there. And then when the elders, the men they would be out doing other chores and different things, chopping wood or whatever. And then when they came back, they were told there was a gentleman over there, and he's been taken care of. The ladies have been feeding him. They've been giving him water and he's well rested and he wants to speak with you, and they would come and they would talk. So, it's our way of saying, welcome here, you know, get you some food. You know, and relax and the words that will be given, they're sacred. So, things that you acknowledge is a great thing here to come here in Florida and to be welcomed here by your native people. Thank you.
Charles Henry:	00:03:52	A few brief items here. I just wanted to remind you something that you all are familiar with, um, is the DLF mission and our obligation to our communities. DLF's main, one of its main purposes, advancing research, learning, social justice, and the public good through the creative design and wise application of digital library technology. I think we all feel that and we all sense that it's a powerful mission, and it's one that's, I think it elevates us to execute. You look at the program over the next two days and you can see these principles and these aspirations reflected in the program. I think, very powerfully. Part of the presentation, some of the presentations have to do with the transformation of traditional professional roles. Others look at decolonizing the web, others look at democratizing digitization. Several of them look and talk about advocating for a fair and just workplace.
Charles Henry:	00:05:10	So these are all noble, noble goals, noble aspirations. I'm also intrigued by some other presentations looking at new kinds of technology. One in particular leapt out, the work on ancient manuscripts using high energy particle physics and linear accelerators to uncover hidden texts, palimpsest texts underneath the writing on the surface of the parchment. This is digital humanities in a new key, and I think it speaks to the kind of breadth and diversity and interdisciplinary aspect of the Forum. Increasingly, we see this.
Charles Henry:	00:06:05	I did want to mention also, we have a code of conduct. I think you all are familiar with that. Here's the web link to that we are

committed to make this, this forum free from all forms of harassment. We want you to feel comfortable. We want you to feel secure. We want you to be able to voice your ideas and concerns without any kind of restriction. So, if at any point, you feel constrained or you feel uneasy, please go to the website, more immediately the staff, CLIR DLF staff will all have white lanyards and they will all be available for you if you have something to report or you have a question or again, you feel a bit uneasy of something that's being said or done. Um, there's also a number to call 732-RESPECT, and that will get you assistance there as well.

Charles Henry: 00:07:15 Back to the Palm trees. Very brief remarks. I think most of you know that DLF is about to celebrate its 25th anniversary and it's just astounding to stand up here and look at this room full of wonderful professionals gathered together for such a terrific purposes and presentations over the next two days. DLF actually started, it was an idea that came about 26, 27 years ago and it was formulated by a group that called themselves the LaGuardia Seven. The LaGuardia Seven was a small group, usually seven, and it grew a bit to eight, nine, I think eventually 12, but it was mostly library directors who found themselves stuck in LaGuardia as they were going between conferences. So maybe ARL, maybe ALA, and they routinely would find themselves in a lounge or a bar and they would sit around and at some point the LaGuardia Seven began to talk about a very new phenomenon.

Charles Henry: 00:08:28 And one that was both exciting and also concerned them. And that was the idea of digital libraries. And so, the LaGuardia Seven got together and they said, our organizations, our professional organizations are not really wrestling with what we think are the implications of digital libraries. They're new. At that time, they were kind of small and they were often secret, staff in certain libraries would kind of build these digital libraries and kind of keep them to themselves. So, the LaGuardia Seven wanted this to be exposed and wanted to explore the implications of this new phenomenon. And they did. And they did it through the formation of the Digital Library Federation. And that got put together about 25, 24 years ago. And here we are today. It's also amazing to think what has happened in 25 years from these small, often, you know, these really kind of under the radar projects of a quarter century ago.

Charles Henry: 00:09:34 Look at what the world has to offer today. Some of the most prominent and the largest libraries in the world are digital libraries. You look at Europeana and its hundreds of millions of records, Tiancon in Brazil, Trove in Australia, Digital New

Zealand, the Digital Library of the middle East and others. The National Diet Digital Library in Japan. It's all over the world. The new digital library, the National Digital Library of India encompasses, I think, at this point, nearly a hundred languages and eventually hundreds and hundreds of millions of records. So, it's huge. It's flourished in ways. I don't think the LaGuardia Seven could have imagined 20 some years ago. So here we are and thank you again for coming. Before I move to introduce Louisa, I did want to recognize a distinguished colleague of ours. And that's Bethany Nowviskie.

Charles Henry: 00:10:48 I think most of you know Bethany. I wanted to recognize the exceptional work and contributions that she gave to DLF and to the Forum as our director. She was, and is, an articulate and compassionate voice for inclusion, social justice, and diversity. In her time here, she built bridges across communities and assured the highest quality of DLF program development and outreach. I think we can look so optimistically at our 25th anniversary in large part because of the strength of the programs that Bethany enhanced and enriched. So, I'd like to say on behalf of all of us to Bethany, we miss you. We do wish you will and your new job at James Madison University and to underscore that you are always welcome here. Thank you.

Charles Henry: 00:12:00 Okay, I'd like to introduce Louisa Kwasigroch who's going to talk a bit about sponsors.

Louisa Kwasigroch: 00:12:06 And now a little bit about our sponsors. First, we'd very much like to thank Carnegie Mellon University Libraries for supporting the live streaming and the recording of the plenary sessions. Our beautiful lanyards are supported by Quartex, powered by Adam Matthew Digital. Our Gold sponsors include AVP Aviary Platform, Data Curation Experts, East View Information Services, and LibNova. We also have OCLC, Samvera, Web of Science Group, a Clarivate Analytics company, and Zontal. Our Bronze sponsor is the MetaArchive cooperative and we're very grateful for the coffee break on Thursday, which is sponsored by Digital Bedrock. Please visit our amazing exhibitors at the tables outside and let them know that you appreciate their support. You can vote at their tables to win a 2020 Forum registration and other fabulous prizes. I would also like to thank our Fellowship Partners, the American Institute for Conservation, the Art Libraries Society of North America, the Association of Research Libraries, Library Juice Academy, MCN, the Visual Resources Association, and I really want to give a special shout out to all of you. Many of you have supported the childcare fund. It makes a huge difference for our colleagues when they can have support for their families. Thank you.

Louisa Kwasigroch: 00:13:57 At DLF, we've been doing that for three years now and we're really happy to continue doing that. You can get t-shirts at the registration desk that will support the childcare fund. Finally, I'd like to thank the Forum Sponsorship Committee which was led by our amazing chair Gabrielle Michalek from Carnegie Mellon Universities. Thank you.

Charles Henry: 00:14:19 It's a great privilege and a pleasure to introduce our opening plenary speaker Marisa Duarte. Marisa is assistant professor at the School of Social Transformation at Arizona State University. Her research focuses on problems of information technology and knowledge in the context of Native American interests and indigenous contexts as well. This includes some recent work on social media and its impact on these cultures. She is also a member of the Human Security Collaboratory, which is part of the Global Security Initiative at ASU. She's also interested, apropos of DLF and the Forum, large scale digital infrastructures that make accessible indigenous ways of knowing. I have read through Marisa's biography and some of her works and I can say that her interests and her focus, her research focus, is timely and urgent and it is a privilege to welcome you here today. Marisa's title is “Beautiful Data: Justice, Code and Architectures of the Sublime.” Would you please welcome Marisa Duarte.

Marisa Duarte: 00:15:42 Good morning, can you hear me? I'm short so I have to do this. (speaking Yaqui language) I'm from the Pascua Yaqui Tribe. (speaking Yaqui language) Mr. Jim, thank you for allowing me to speak on your lands. This is the first time I've visited Florida and have gotten to, you know, take a little bit of look around and I'm just really happy to be here. It's a pleasure to be able to visit with librarians. My work is greatly influenced by librarians and now, although I focus quite a bit more on justice work, I've left, I feel like I've left the library fields as a practitioner. I'm still with you as a theorist and I'd like to share with you today an insight about how librarianship and justice weave together into one long braid through the tapestry of humanity. If history is written by the conquerors then it is the librarians and archivists who maintain the records of their crimes so that the conquered, the oppressed, the marginalized, the enslaved and subjugated can look back into those files to find the seeds of their liberation.

Marisa Duarte: 00:16:55 I titled this talk in this way because it is awesome, in the biblical use of the word. That is, it feels like looking upon the face of the divine when a person liberates herself or when people become liberated. It is beautiful just as the human spirit can be in moments when the virtue of justice is embodied, internalized and realized, I first learned the philosophical meaning of the word sublime in 2001 when I was a library science student at

the Catholic University of America in Washington DC. I was a reference assistant in the John K. Mullen Library. Did anybody graduate from CU by any chance? Yeah, there's like one person. You know, but I really appreciated my time there. So many libraries in Washington, DC. I was a reference assistant in the Mullen Library. It's a white granite building with large windows overlooking a great green lawn. I would arrive shortly before the library opened, switch on the computers.

Marisa Duarte: 00:17:53 I would arrange the main reading room so that people would be ready to take a look at our reference collection, relax in the chairs, and I would visit and answer questions with students, scholars, and community members. I had only had the job for a couple of weeks when disciples of Osama bin Laden crashed a plane into one of the twin towers in New York city and more crashed a plane into the Pentagon. It was an autumn morning that forever changed the lives of millions of people. It was a morning of irrevocable injustice. One of the reference librarians had a small rabbit ears TV in the back office. I left my post at the desk to crowd around the TV with other staff members. I suppose I watched the broadcast for no more than 10 or 15 minutes. My godfather worked at the Pentagon at the time. I worried for him. After my four-hour shift ended, I ran to my apartment across from Trinity College in Northeast DC. Within a couple of months an anti-aircraft missile would be parked on their lawn.

Marisa Duarte: 00:18:52 I tried calling my parents in New Mexico, but the phone lines were tied up as millions of people reached out to each other. At the same time, the beltway was packed with fearful citizens attempting to escape. Fear gripped the city. Would there be a bombing? Would there be a poisoning, biological warfare? I rushed to the dormitory of the one friend I had made as a new student on campus. A young woman from Botswana who had temporarily left her daughter and husband to complete her MLIS degree in the United States. She was sitting on the edge of her bed in the dim light of her dorm room. I told her I had a plan and like an overconfident child. I assured her that we would catch buses all the way to my parents' isolated Adobe home in New Mexico, safe beneath the weaponry of the White Sands Missile Range.

Marisa Duarte: 00:19:37 We were at the beginning of the US war on terror. The people of DC and New York would find themselves shocked into moments of panic for years thereafter. I did not leave the city that season and neither did my friend from Botswana. Later that autumn, I ended up helping the nephew of Hamid Karzai, future president of Afghanistan, search LexisNexis to find articles to

support his claim that there were no weapons of mass destruction in Iraq and that, in fact, the impending US occupation pertained to a need to control an oil pipeline beneath the Caspian sea. Predicting the war, Karzai sent his family, including his nephew to various cities in the US and the UK to study and live safely in stable Western democracies. Future allies to the nation building efforts in Iraq and Afghanistan, which I later learned is also known as the Graveyard of Empires. I was 23 years old and I did not know that the US was an empire and that many of the wars I had been watching on TV since I was 11 had a basis in the oil-hungry energy infrastructure of this country.

Marisa Duarte: 00:20:44 I did not realize that when President George W. Bush enacted the USA Patriot Act in the month after the towers fell, the national surveillance apparatus structured through the National Security Agency, the State Department, the Department of Defense, and the Central Intelligence Agency was already sufficiently extant such that machine-learning capacity for signals intelligence was less of a challenge than the necessary intra-agency coordination around data sharing. As a library student. It did not escape me that racism was embedded in the Dewey Decimal System and the AACR2, the Anglo-American cataloging rules, but I didn't realize then as I do now that my body and being, along with those of every other American immigrant and refugee treading US soil, we're becoming an endless source of metadata for a low grade informatic coloniality. The following spring, I took a class in American rhetoric and the professor diagnosed the era we were living through. He said that watching the towers fall was horrifying and awful, but also strangely awesome. He said it was like observing the destructive force of a divine power. One could not look away. As Americans, we watched it over and over. The news stations replayed it every day for months. It was as he stated, sublime and it was preventing our minds from grasping the political and historical complexity of our times.

Marisa Duarte: 00:22:15 All this happened 18 years ago. I now have white hair, a PhD, and my own small family and I teach justice theory to undergraduate students at Arizona State University. A few hours north of the US-Mexico border. Five years ago, I decided to apply the lessons from my practice as a librarian to students dedicated to studies of social justice. I also teach surveillance studies and digital activism. I now know the definition of a just war, a phrase I first heard as an 11-year-old reading a children's newspaper at Zia Middle School in Las Cruces, New Mexico. President George H. Bush described the war in Iraq and Operation Desert Storm in particular as a just war. The story

included a picture of a US soldiers standing guard over oil fields on fire. According to 17th century English political theorists, Thomas Hobbes and John Locke, war in a state of lawlessness is just as men exercise their natural right to self-preservation.

Marisa Duarte: 00:23:13 Yet who determines when a society is in a state of lawlessness? Isn't every society richly layered with codes of belonging and conduct that shaped the virtuous pleasures of our lives? Must every moment in society be evaluated as a potential legal transferring of rights? What of all the relational moments that make us human? Libraries are places of knowing and places of understanding. I tell these anecdotes about war and injustice because from those vantage points as compassionate thinkers, we can do the reflexive justice work that restores our humanity that prevents us from accepting the crazy-making logics of wartime, insecurity, and endless preemptive force. We maintain records of war and conquest in our libraries and archives. We discern insights about peace and humanity as we contemplate the meaning of those records. Artifacts of relationships gone wrong. Like many university instructors, I send my students to do research in the library.

Marisa Duarte: 00:24:15 I encourage my doctoral students to trace clues through archival finding aids. I tell them, to do research is not to prove what you already know or to win an argument, but rather to discern the single thread in a mass of stories that in its purest meaning renders myriad relationships clear. To research is to insist on meaning. Many times, the picture is not clear for generations. The US government did not declassify and release the Pentagon papers until nearly 40 years after Daniel Ellsberg leaked its most damning contents to the New York Times. I teach my students about US involvement in Vietnam and ask them to consider why, in the 1960s, Reverend Martin Luther King ,Jr. found common cause with Buddhist priests and anti-war activists Thich Nhat Hanh who shared with him the prayer of one of his students: Lord Buddha, help us to be alert, to realize that we are not victims of each other.

Marisa Duarte: 00:25:11 We are victims of our own ignorance and ignorance of others. Help us to avoid engaging in ourselves more mutual slaughter because of the will of others to power and to predominance. Months after Buddhist monk Thich Quang Duc self-immolated amid a busy intersection in Saigon in protest of the South Vietnamese oppression of Buddhists and Reverend King marched on Washington to deliver his famous anti-racist vision, I have a dream, he said. I need for my students to understand how racism and oppression are mechanisms of Imperial designs. All of the evidence is there in libraries and archives waiting for

us to decipher it for its deeper moral significance. Yet, when faced with their own research problems, many of my students view the library as a website where they can download three to five scholarly sources for their term papers. They do not understand why archival documents are not all full text.

Marisa Duarte: 00:26:09 They prefer Google scholar to library databases and digital archival collections. Many of them have full time jobs and families and are not eager to read books that are not required. This is a story about class and higher education. Yet every year at least one or two find transcendence through the narratives located in libraries and archives, they find it when they realize how stories of humanity repeat in different keys throughout history, making justice and injustice, the story of the human condition with the trajectories of their lives as part of that great mystery. Those who realize this about themselves and the world around them tell me they feel both lighter and stronger. I see it in their composure. They know something at a deeper level of their being. They taste the cognitive piece of the radical intellectual. They glimpse the serenity in the stacks.

Marisa Duarte: 00:27:06 So now I'm delivering this morning lecture to you who specialize in creating digital architectures that structure the flow of information beyond the materiality of the stacks. When I was in library school, we had this debate: are libraries neutral or are they inherently political? According to one of my favorites, John Locke, did you catch my irony? According to Locke's 17th century definition of conquest, I come from a conquered people. The evidence is in our apparent absence in most national and university libraries and archives. If one cleaves to the knowledge found in a great American library, my people hardly existed, and their philosophies and histories are marginal. Yet according to my mother, my aunts, my grandparents, and many, many cousins, we are not conquered, but rather in a moment of quiet recuperation and our ceremonies, our commitment to our stories and histories are the evidence of our will to persist.

Marisa Duarte: 00:28:04 Our tribal historians insist we're the only indigenous people who were not conquered through the colonial wars of New Spain and the Wars for Mexican independence. Our people have an autonomous zone in present day. Sonora, Mexico and a reservation in Arizona. We have tribal libraries. My Aunt Amargareyas works in one on the res outside of Tucson. We also have community libraries and community museums. My friend Domi Molina operates a community library in Potam, Sonora, in Mexico. Many Yaki families have their personal family archives. To me, public libraries and state and university

archives are deeply political and in fact exist in so far as they appeal to the national ideology. Yet. This does not mean that they are inherently agents of conquest library materials and archival records flow beyond institutional walls, into private Instagram feeds and onto Facebook timelines and albums. During community history days, tribal educators share historical photos and maps and the elders point out their friends and relatives and where they used to live and talk about how they used to live. It strengthens us as a people. As a people, we synthesize the information, recover anthropological datasets, the perceptions of the conquerors and tell our stories as we know them to be true. The truth of our history imbues our sacred songs with beauty.

Marisa Duarte: 00:29:28 18 years ago, my professor of American rhetoric diagnosed the postmodern spectacle of the war on terror. Currently, if I am to diagnose things, I'd say we are living through an era marked by pan-capitalist, algorithmic domination. The 2001 USA Patriot act boosted surveillance and security infrastructures to the point such that it has become socially expected for us to give away our privacy rights every time we agree to use a new smartphone app. Most of our universities rely on Google to manage our students' emails. In essence, allowing the content of our students' messages and web searches to be used for rendering corporate data doubles so that third party advertisers can sell our students more stuff. Our privacy rights have not become a means towards self-determination, but rather a currency with which we gain entree into a new disposable bit of software each year. I think of new ways to teach my students about algorithmic discrimination, the surveillance of people of color, indigenous people, queer and trans people, immigrants, refugees, former convicts and activists through data mining and machine learning infrastructures.

Marisa Duarte: 00:30:38 Last year I relied on a collection from the World Digital Library containing sketches of the mutinous slaves who had overtaken the Amistad slave ship off the coast of Cuba in 1839. I also found maps of slave plantations in the Caribbean islands and along the southeast coast of the US dated from 1700 to 1821. I asked the students to interpret the sketches and maps not as historical artifacts, a view into a world that once was, but rather as evidence of surveillance and race class oppression. I asked them to consider the power of the artist's drawing skill and the surveyor's map-making. I asked them to consider the power of the archivist who thought to upload label and collocate these images in a digital collection. I also asked students to review the FBI archive of declassified documents regarding the surveillance of the black nationalist movements of the 1970s the students

recognize these techniques of image making of design and datafication as part of a continuum.

Marisa Duarte: 00:31:38 One that explains contemporary surveillance of the No DAPL movement and the Black Lives Matter movement and of people of color generally and one that makes algorithmic discrimination seem not to be a new phenomena, but rather the technical refinement of the Imperial power of the archive. At a 1978 White House convening on the state of library services to American Indians, Dakota scholar Vine Deloria, Jr. insisted that American Indian people need libraries because we have a right to know the historical and contemporary causes of our oppression. This right to know extends to all marginalized and oppressed peoples and especially to those who do not even realize that they are living under conditions of domination.

Marisa Duarte: 00:32:29 Those of you who curate these collections, who label them to make them accessible through digital means the seeds of our liberation are embedded in the code that you create. When I was a library student in DC, I would escape the rhetoric of the war on terror. By doing my homework, I was at peace shelving and cleaning books. I dedicated myself to practicing writing out MARC records by hand and then comparing them to what appeared in the interface of the OPAC. I tried out dialogue and anachronism even back then. I learned reference services through browsing, through the card catalog and by memorizing the types of encyclopedias on our shelves. I took workshops in HTML and XML and it was pleasurable to write clean code and to see how the bibliographic universe could interlace with the infrastructures of the world wide web. And moreover, that through that informatic weaving, someone like Hamid Karzai's nephew, a refugee from a new world war could access investigative news stories to search for evidence against the misinformation that we as Americans were hearing at the time through the talking heads of CNN.

Marisa Duarte: 00:33:33 Looking back, if I could be in that classroom debate, I would assert that those who cleave to the idea that libraries are apolitical are likely to strip future generations of oppressed peoples of their right to know. How can a person who refuses to understand the informatic dimensions of the cycle of conquest, injustice, sovereignty and liberation, know how to curate collections that bear the potential for moral reflection? How will they know how to meet the intellectual needs of survivors? But that debate was back then, and the debates of the present are trickier. Instead, we may now ask ourselves, when is data sharing a political and under what conditions are we morally obligated to STEM the flow of certain kinds of data? We may ask

ourselves; how can we make our digital collections accessible to those who may need them most in different parts of the world at different points in history, through various kinds of media channels?

Marisa Duarte: 00:34:29 We may ask ourselves, how is gender inequality reflected in our design practices? How are race and class reflected in our design practices? Who are the readers of the future? How will we curate, design and make our collections meaningful for them? How will we share with them the serenity in the stacks? The moral truth value, the beauty of the documents that we care for? In times to come, the digital library and the digital archive will increasingly be an integral component in many peoples' right to engage in the reflexive justice work that predicates the tribunal, the court case, the revisionist history, and the restorative dialogues amongst survivors and descendants of national Wars over territory, intellectual property, labor and natural resources. As human beings, we are none of those things. We are not simply objects of labor or consumers of paper, oil and water. We are parents and teachers, people who share stories and charm, people who laugh and care for one another.

Marisa Duarte: 00:35:35 We garden and cultivate. We read, we think and write. We are artists. We make things, we pray, we food. We food, we feed and nourish one another. I haven't had enough of that this morning. Dear digital curators, we are not simply users of interfaces and systems. We learn in ways that machines cannot. This is how I want my justice studies students to think of themselves as human beings capable of acting and thinking beyond the carceral logics of war and colonization. I hope that through this perspective that you as librarians and archivists can thus imagine yourselves as compassionate time travelers. Not only due to your dedication to caring for the documents of the past, but also in your designs for socially just futures. Thank you. And happy Indigenous Peoples Day.

Marisa Duarte: 00:36:48 I think we have time for questions. Is that correct?

Aliya Reich: 00:36:51 We have, hi everyone, over here. We do have time for Q and A and I am over here on my tippy toes for these very tall mics to say that we have mics, so if you do have a question, please use them. There is one where I am standing and there is one on the other side of the room. Alternatively, Marisa would you please advance the slide to the next. If you, for whatever reason would not like to ask your question this way, you can put a question into that, the document in that link and one of our members of our inclusivity committee will ask it for you.

Audience Member:	00:37:41	I'm short too. Is this on? Okay, I've never asked a question in this big group before. There's tons of work happening with AI and machine learning and I don't think we can stop that flow of information, turn things around, right? So how do we humanize it? How do we make it the thing that we're not afraid of? Does that make sense?
Marisa Duarte:	00:38:07	I think I got it. So, I'll give an example of why and how we stop the flow of information conscientiously, deliberately. It does feel quite overwhelming doesn't it? Like we're still surrounded by information and we can't just go to Facebook and say, stop, you know. We can't go to Lincoln labs or anything and say, stop. Especially because by definition, artificial intelligence is anything involving some aspect of machine learning. You know, where there's training data. It's ubiquitous. It certainly feels that way. It only feels that way though if you confuse your being with your data double. And this is something that we as native peoples have really been dealing with for quite a while, right? Because before our data doubles were digitized, we had data doubles in the forms of anthropological records that were just wildly misinformed or deceptive about who we were as a people and who at the same time did not recognize us as individuals bearing rights.
Marisa Duarte:	00:39:22	Interestingly, and so what native tribes, many tribes have done to kind of stop this widespread, you know, misinformation is to enact controls over access. And that is by going to those institutions that have some of these data doubles present. And by saying, okay, we're either going to repatriate, you know, and we're going to look at these various classifications, whether they're cultural patrimony or whatever, we're going to repatriate or we're going to put access rules on things. You know, only certain people can look at these particular records at this time of year or to see more. They have to come to our traditional historic preservation officer or so essentially what I'm talking about is an arrangement between institutions. And this is challenging for a lot of Americans to deal with because most of us do not have that kind of negotiating power to set up arrangements with institutions.
Marisa Duarte:	00:40:21	We have to be employees of an institution in some sort of power, you know, some sort of administrative power to go into that kind of arrangement. And this is where indigenous thought is helpful, I think. I tell people, you know, you really ought to study American Indian history because it'll give you greater rights as an American individual. As tribes, we have sovereign rights. We can, we have rights belonging to our tribal communities and as American citizens. So we have like multi-

layers of rights. Most Americans, you only have rights as citizens, maybe rights in your municipality, your state, you know, and through your congressional representatives. But that doesn't mean that you should be comfortable with only that set of rights. You can exercise group rights through whatever means possible, which is what we have done as tribal people. It's not like the US was like, Oh man, you guys are sovereign. We really should respect that.

Marisa Duarte: 00:41:19 Nobody has ever said that. I don't think. I've been looking for a long time. Nobody has ever said that.

Marisa Duarte: 00:41:27 Right? So, as Americans, when you're saying, Oh, but we can't stop it. Well, maybe, yes you can. You just need to push really hard and think really deliberately about what kind of information you feel ought to be protected for the group rights of a people. So that's one way to do about it. It's particular, I'm speaking to you all now because many of you in this room actually are those folks with administrative power through your institutions. You actually have that, most people in this room have multiple degrees and you'd belong to multiple associations. And probably it's very easy. I remember this when I was a librarian, it was very easy to be stuck in the tyranny of the bureaucracy of the library. You know, sort of like looking at the rules of the library, the codes of conduct or the general American library values or whatever and thinking, okay, I guess I have to follow these rules.

Marisa Duarte: 00:42:30 But, you know, the whole point of a democracy is that you're kind of like not supposed to always follow the rules. You know, dissent is very patriotic and in some of these circumstances, it's necessary. And I really think about this when I think, okay, okay, well maybe I'm not gonna have a heart attack today about the fact that my students' emails are being mined, you know, and Amazon is able to market them Pop Tarts, you know. They know that like this particular group needs this kind of socks in this season in Vermont. And it's like that kind of, okay, it's kind of capitalist and I'm, you know, skeptical of that as an indigenous person. But okay. The things that I really struggle with though are information being circulated about undocumented peoples, about immigrants. You know, ICE coming to public schools and bullying people and asking for information, you know, and libraries have a role in that.

Marisa Duarte: 00:43:32 They really, really do. It's just whether or not we can get it together to kind of like think in a new way to organize around that and to make statements. Library science. We are scientifically conscientious objectors to lots of things. We just

have to kind of like learn to think that way and not to go on much longer on that particular point. But I'm also part of the human computer interaction, community, HCI community. And these are the folks who make these algorithms and make these awesome systems. I have colleagues who design bots and all kinds of stuff, bots for good and all this. And it's incredibly impressive the work that they do. But many of them are not trained in justice. Many of them are not trained in social theory. Many of them claim to see the human, but they see the human as a user. They don't see a human as a human being. Somebody with rights, somebody with an intellectual trajectory. And that is something that I think we can rely on. So no, there's not an easy answer. You know, I wish there was, I think, I think if it was an easy answer, we would've done it right? But I would love to galvanize librarians and archivists because of the long view and insights about history.

Marisa Duarte: 00:45:04 Somebody ask an easy question.

Audience Member: 00:45:07 Good morning, thank you for your presentation. It was very illuminating. Quick question about class. You talked about class in regards to your student demographic. So, if we're talking about information, that migration into this digital or AI world, what happens to those individuals who do not go to colleges, that do not pursue education past high school? How do they then conceive of, and are included in, the information literacy world, which is going increasingly digital? So, what does that look like in terms of the community both documented and undocumented and matriculating?

Marisa Duarte: 00:45:40 I really appreciate that question. I try to teach my students about this. I don't know how much of it sticks. Um, so when I used to do bibliographic instruction, and I'm a little bit embarrassed now, when I think about the way I used to do BI, you know, because what the way I would teach it was generally, you know, this is, this is the map of the library.

Marisa Duarte: 00:46:01 This is where you can get your resources, this is your homework assignment, and call us. To some degree that wasn't entirely my fault. I mean, many universities, it's like whether or not the professor invites you to speak and you have what, 30 minutes, you know, with students you'll never see again. I mean, hopefully we see them again. But now what I teach them, so just to give a little bit of background, Arizona State University has a commitment to providing a college education affordable, public, you know, college education to all residents of the state of Arizona as long as they have a B average in high school. And so this is Arizona public schools. So, a B average in Arizona

public school is probably like more like a C, you know, and so many of our students who come to us are from very diverse backgrounds for all the causes of structural racism and inequity that many of you understand, right?

Marisa Duarte: 00:46:58 So we have a large amount of undocumented students, a large amount of Spanish speaking, Hispanic, Latino, Latinx students, Mexican and Mexican American students. We have a high number of Native American students. Our actual lower number students is our Black and African American students. We have a great many of students from other countries who come to us and many of them are first generation, they work full time, most of them, and they have children, or they have parents who are support, who they support. So, when they come to class, they're not always there. You know, they're, they're occupied thinking about other things, big responsibilities in their lives. And they're often worried about poverty. You know, they're often worried about like, well, you know, I can't afford to lose my job. I'm not a trust fund kid. I can't, I don't have a daddy who's paying for my college education.

Marisa Duarte: 00:47:55 Like I'm doing this on my own and GI bill or loans or whatever. And so, what I teach them now is I teach them about information and poverty, the cycle of poverty. So what's happening now when it comes to algorithmic discrimination is that if you are poor, as many students are, and you're relying on food stamps or you're, you yourself have to work with a case worker, social worker, you're caring for foster kids or anything like that. Anything that puts you in touch with the system every time you go in to one of these places to get your services or to report, you know, to go through parole or whatever, probation, anything like that, you're giving information to the state. And that information is being organized in a range that is the training data for these systems that eventually lead to an algorithmic discrimination such that, for example, let's say a student is on food stamps and let's say the student commits some minor infraction.

Marisa Duarte: 00:48:55 You know, and this is Arizona. So, I mean, you know, there's like famous rap songs about our state, you know, and, and the police brutality in our state, right? So, a student commits a minor infraction, the students get taken in, you know, it pops up on the same interface when they come in to renew and get their food stamps. It pops up on that same interface and the case worker's like, well, what happened here? And it's a mark against that student. And so, I started watching the legislations that were passing through the state of Arizona a few years back and looking for anything that had to do with algorithmic

discrimination. And there are quite a bit of new laws coming out, new legislations that say that allow for the creation of these databases in the hands of the government to track and apprehend, so called criminals.

Marisa Duarte: 00:49:46 But it's preemptive because you don't know what a criminal is until it's been done. So, the way that they do it is by keeping track of people who have been released. And as many people know, and I don't know if you know this, actually, at least in my state, one in three families have somebody who is a convict. Either somebody that's in the system or that somebody that somebody is out of the system and they're on probation, that counts. And when people get arrested, you know, and they have to go through this calculation, through the case worker fills out this information about them. They ask them, you know, are you drug-related? Are you, are you gang-related, are other people in your family? Are there other felons or people who have committed misdemeanors or whatever, this questionnaire you fill out, that's the training data and it produces a calculation that helps the judge sort of figure out, well what's the percentage likeliness that they're going to recidivate.

Marisa Duarte: 00:50:43 And so this cycle continues. If you kind of get the picture of what I'm saying, right. And we can see how some states, strong-arm states take advantage of this. We have the social code in China where they will even track who you're friends with, you know, what you search for on the web. And that determines whether or not you can eat in certain restaurants, whether or not you can live in certain communities. In the US that's a terrible thought to us. We were like, we would never do that. And yet if you ask a queer or trans person, if they can live in a certain apartment complex in a certain state, they very well know that they cannot, they have to be extremely careful. We have, we still have laws that prevent fair housing for gay, queer and trans people. So, it's like kind of putting your lenses on, critical lenses on, and learning how this technological redlining happens for particular populations.

Marisa Duarte: 00:51:39 You know, and the, the one irony that's always really huge to me is how our people can be, how can people be undocumented when there is so much documentation about them? You know, it's an irony at what that is. What's happening is that the state is actually keeping them undocumented, you know, and they, they're proving it right over and over. So, it's kinda like, okay, where's the money going? Palantir? You know, why are we giving money to Palantir when maybe we should be, you know, boosting up our resources in our offices that provide for refugee status and all that kind of stuff. So that's kinda how

the way I teach my students now, I teach them about it from the angle of poverty. And this is why you need to be conscientious of your informatic flow, your data shed, your data exhaust, and be conscientious of privacy mechanisms like using VPNs and all that kind of thing. And yeah, it's fundamentally unjust. There's parts of it that are fundamentally unjust, but my goal is not to, I mean I teach justice, so I teach students how to look at this stuff in the face of what it is. And if they can't make the change for themselves, they need to make it for their children.

Moderator: 00:52:53 this is a question from our shared document. Boy, everyone here is short, I guess, I don't know. This person asks, do you think it's possible to advocate for change, the change you're describing, which I also want within the context of a neoliberal capitalist higher education system? Sometimes I just want to give up on it.

Marisa Duarte: 00:53:12 Yeah, it's a drag, right? So, we're in this interesting situation right now where Neoliberalism and neoconservatism are actually in this, a dance with each other. So, you know, neoliberalism is essentially the state saying, you know, it's too expensive to provide for all the rights of y'all people. So, you need to buy your own rights. And so, the wealthy get to experience the most privileges in society 'cause they can literally buy them, you know. A great example, I'll use another example from Arizona, is that we have a lot of crime in Arizona, but rather than doing things like focusing on better schools or dealing with homeless population or opiate addiction, things like this, the state instead says, you know, this is just too expensive. You know, y'all people, let's just open up that land for more land, you know, housing.

Marisa Duarte: 00:54:10 And so the land developers are like, ooh we love that idea. And they build these gated communities that, where you then have people self-selecting to live in there and they have similar shared values, which are mostly fear-based. You know, like, we need all these gates, we need all these, we need ring, we need all this like extra surveillance so that I feel safe because the state will not provide it for me. That's how neoliberalism works. But if you can see that neoconservative part in there, right? Of course, law enforcement and military, all these kinds of things that thrive on this fear, they get more revenues as well. And we start investing in technologies that are living on this feeling of uncertainty and insecurity. So, these kind of work together. And that's important to realize because, if you are in a neoliberal university, which I am. ASU is famously corporate, you know, it's

kind of a model where they were like, Oh man, we agreed to educate all these people and we can't do it.

Marisa Duarte: 00:55:07 We don't have enough resources to let in this many students. So, let's contract out as many services as possible. That's the, the model at ASU. This is now I'm going to get a message I'm sure from the president or others for being, this is being live-cast and recorded and (chuckles), but, what ends up happening is that in a neoliberal university it's very frustrating because every time we come up with a new idea, you know, that has some moral value that's really emphasizing our rights. Privacy, right. Especially the rights that folks already don't understand. Like privacy rights, many times you'll have somebody who just kind of like, listens and is like, we appreciate your concern, right? And then it's kind of lost in the next cycle of whatever. Many of you know, this experience that universities only support diversity when they're financially flush, you know, and when they're broke, they're like, we can't afford that this year.

Marisa Duarte: 00:56:03 Sorry, you all can have a bake sale for, you know, Martin Luther King. I'm like what, that's absurd. Right? So what do we do in that situation? Well, the first thing is that we need to understand that we have a long view of things, you know, um, um, and that this is extremely challenging. I've been, of course, I've been reading Czeslaw Milosz, like the most depressing Eastern European writer before I come to this conference. We have to understand that this is something that requires a consciousness raising. And that means that we're going to have to spend time with each other and with our students to deliberately look at these contours of domination in our lives and reach for something bigger and better. We have to, we have to do the consciousness, consciousness raising before we do the organizing.

Marisa Duarte: 00:57:00 You know, we have to basically plant the seeds of discontent. And I don't mean being like a, a rabble rouser, an agitator, as they used to say in the 1950s, right? What I'm talking about is pointing out the contours of domination that people already feel in their lives. So, I give this lecture every year to the students because I have both conservative and liberal students in my classes in justice. And I'm like, okay, here's one thing we all have in common that we're struggling with right now. Student loan crisis. Many of you, when you graduate from this four or five, six years undergraduate degree, however long it takes, you're looking at a close to a hundred thousand dollars in debt, even at Arizona State University, which is affordable and there, and the room just gets quiet. And I feel this like tension rising because they're worried that they won't have jobs after

that are going to be able to match up to what they're going to owe.

Marisa Duarte: 00:57:52 And so when I talk about it that way, when I say, okay, what do we need to change in the legislative system? What do we need to change in the public schooling system to address this? What do we need to change so that you all are not passing on this debt in different ways to your children, you know, and to your family members? Because even if you know, theoretically, legally like student loan debt can't be inherited and passed on, they're still passing on the fact that they are bringing home $700 less than their paycheck every single month and they can't afford dental care and they can't afford childcare and they can't afford to live in the place that they want to live and all that kind of thing. Right? So, if I frame things in that way, you know, all of a sudden, they look around and they begin to ask, okay, let me ask for more from my universities.

Marisa Duarte: 00:58:41 Let me ask for more, you know, from my employers. Let me ask for more and let me paint it in a way that brings people, you know, into my court that they can empathize with. And so, I think that's, you know, it's easy to get demoralized in a neoliberal university. I actually, you know, I hope I'm not saying too much, but you know, our graduate students often are the ones who struggle the most in that situation. They're underpaid and they're expected to work an incredible amount, you know, but I always remind the graduate students, I know, you're feeling very overworked and overwhelmed right now and you are going through a kind of an academic hazing, but you are the elite with this graduate degree, you will become the elite in this country. So, this moment of suffering is short-lived, two to five years.

Marisa Duarte: 00:59:33 But with that degree, you're literally entitled, that's what it is. To have a master's degree or PhD, you're literally entitled to certain kinds of administrative authority and you have to use it. You know, we can't just like, oh yeah, this paper doesn't mean anything to me. You know, what means something to me is I'm a Raiders fan or something. You can't do that. You are a public intellectual. Use it. That's kind of the beauty, strangely, of being in a neoliberal university in the United States, in a democracy is that, look, I'm tired, but there is Czeslaw Milosz books on the shelf and we are going to have a reading group and this is what we're going to do. We're going to open our minds and think in a new way. That gives me strength. But I am a nerd and I like to read and I, it's empowering.

Audience Member:	01:00:37	You said some powerful things about archives holding the seeds to liberation, and code holding the seed to liberation. I'm wondering, in an individual sense, that archives do bring justice sometimes as far as like land disputes and that sort of thing. But I've never heard of a revolution being sewn out of an archive. And so, I'm just wondering what the solid line is from archives to collective liberation and not just individual liberation and like, the knowing or the pleasure of knowing beyond that.
Marisa Duarte:	01:01:13	So I'm a post-structuralist. I know, like, so one time I gave this, I know some of you have heard me tell this joke before, so just fake laugh if you've heard it before. But one time I had a dream that I was giving a great lecture on the Nerdist perspective, and then the next day I did it.
Marisa Duarte:	01:01:30	You know, this is me saying I'm a post-structuralist only a super nerd would say that, right? A post-structuralist fundamentally sort of believes that collective change is, happens because of the actions of many historical agents operating in the milieu of the moment. And many people who do social media studies who do data mining and machine learning are also post-structuralist because what we do is we literally trace the evidence of interactions between agents, whether they're human or non-human, map them out, and then we can, you know, statistical accuracy predict, you know, is Brexit going to happen? You know, are we going to see voter fraud in the next election? Yes. You know. We can predict these things by looking at these masses of data. All right, so let me change shift gears again. So, what is the line between individual empowerment and the archive toward revolution?
Marisa Duarte:	01:02:33	First of all, revolution doesn't happen overnight, right? It actually takes a few generations. The first, there's a five, a few stages, a few essential conditions for revolution. And I actually don't think we're talking about revolution here. I think we might be talking more about reform, but nevertheless, these conditions apply. And that is that you have an educated middle class with access to infrastructure who are no longer receiving the basic services that they need to pursue life, Liberty, and pursuit of happiness. Okay? So those, that means that you're going to have an educated middle-class, right? They have degrees, they can't get jobs, they have degrees, they have jobs. The money's all sucked out by student loans or whatever. Because they have little financial income, little, you know, movement there they cannot marry, or they choose not to because it would be irresponsible.

Marisa Duarte: 01:03:28 They cannot afford for their children. They cannot buy property and they cannot care for their elders. The seed. That's the seed for reform. That particular combination. And because they're educated, what do they do? You know, when they're not at work, they talk amongst each other and they start to plan. They start to plan. All right? So, the seeds for revolution are when you add a shortage of food, water, and basic health services. When you add that to that, in addition to a corrupt government, that's revolution. Those are, that's the sort of the formula for revolution for reform. However, what ends up happening is that when people start talking, they talk for a long time and it was like, this is an American Indian giving you the seed. Okay, here's the formula. And then we go to our elders and we say, what do we got on paper?

Marisa Duarte: 01:04:17 What are our treaty rights? What are the rights that existed before it was even written on paper? And the elders say, well, here it is. Here's what we did. So in this group, you know, mostly Americans, this is talking about people who were organizing pre Woodstock, you know, people who were organizing in the 1950s people who have a memory of the 1930s and the 1940s when they had to advocate for their rights. Like going back and not relegating that to history but understanding that those were the instructions to get you to where you want to be. So, when it comes to, and this is the archive, right? The archive isn't necessarily only in like this, um, you know, you have to get through all these interfaces and you have to have your subscription or you have to go into a library or literally go into a national government archive with your researcher credentials.

Marisa Duarte: 01:05:09 It isn't necessarily always that. It's just finding the evidence in there and going and talking with your elders and going, talking with your family and clicking that into space. Like let me make it make sense. You know, how does this apply to the present? And then you do your consciousness raising. Book clubs, meeting and cafes, you know, teaching, giving lessons and all that kind of thing with a tactical lens, the more connections that you make, we can, you do the strength of weak ties theory, which is that the people who sort of make the biggest impacts in your life where you're going to find love, where you're going to get your next job, all that kind of stuff. It's not in your immediate circle. It's in the friends of their friends. That's that. That's the group that you want to start organizing around the friends of the friends.

Marisa Duarte: 01:05:58 And we have all this social media tools now that enable this, why we call it connective action instead of collective action. So,

I mean I'm looking at this from an information science perspective, so of course I'm always seeing things in terms of information sharing. How can I share something with the friends of the friends? How can I disseminate information? How can I track it through the friends of the friends and see where that social change is happening? Right? So, I don't want to tell you that it's an easy, you know, it's not an easy answer. Once again, it means that, um, you have to sort of, um, think not only of yourself, you have to start thinking collectively, you know, what social groups are most effected by the changes that I think should happen. What do I have in common with these social groups?

Marisa Duarte: 01:06:45 You know, how are we going to push forward? What institutions are we going to work through? What infrastructures do we actually have access to? You know, that we can make change about, you know, what friends do I have on the inside the inner circle of these different institutions. And it may seem very long and grueling and this is where it gets exhausting. But that is the fire of revolution. Sadly. It isn't all like, frontline protests. Exhilarating. Yeah. Freedom. No. Most of the time actually it's, it's this persistent drudge work, this determination and persistence. Right. So, when I think of the work that many of you do, it's building those infrastructures to allow for that dissemination of information to happen. I could get more nerdy, but I, you know, I still have to have my breakfast sandwich.

Aliya Reich: 01:07:54 Thank you so much. Let's give Marisa another round of applause. That was inspiring. Marisa, thank you so much.

Aliya Reich: 01:08:24 So I hate to cut off the Q and A in that incredible conversation we were just having for the remaining logistics that I have to share with you before we move on to our coffee and our sessions. But, good morning everyone. My name is Aliya Reich. I'm the Program Manager for Conferences and Events here at CLIR and DLF. I have emailed probably with each and every one of you sitting in this room and I'm a much more confident emailer than I am public speaker, so I'm going to try to keep this pretty quick. Okay, great. So we kicked off our programming yesterday with our second ever Learn@DLF, which is a pre-conference day full of workshops and exciting ideas and more than a fifth of you in this room attended workshops yesterday, which meant that Learn@DLF grew by more than 30% this year, which is really exciting.

Aliya Reich: 01:09:13 And it was a great way to start off our 2019 Forum week. For many in this room, this may be your first DLF Forum. Some of you may have been with us for the last 25, maybe not 25 years,

but for many of the last years, and so while only a handful of us were up on stage this morning, dozens and dozens more of dedicated members of the DLF community have been working behind the scenes over the last year plus to get us here today. So, I'd like to take this opportunity to recognize a few of those people quickly, ‘cause I know coffee awaits. So, first, our Forum Planning Committee. Our volunteer planning committee is composed of a program sponsorship community and scholarship subcommittee who all help us manage the crucial tasks for this year's events. The people whose names you see up on this screen have helped us review and decide what goes into the program you'll be enjoying for the next couple of days.

Aliya Reich: 01:10:13 They've helped us secure Forum sponsorships that bring us things like our live streaming and recording and our lanyards, not to mention keep the lights on and the coffee urns full. They've helped us plan social and wellness events to keep this conference balanced, inclusive and fun. And they've helped us determine our Forum fellowship recipients of whom we have 18 from all over the country and the world here with us today and we'll recognize them in a minute. So, suffice it to say, this event simply would not happen without our planning committee planning committee members. Please stand as you're able. Let's give them a round of applause.

Aliya Reich: 01:11:02 Thank you. And by the way, if you're interested in joining next year's planning committee, we'll be sending a call out in December. I mentioned our scholarship committee a moment ago and the individuals on that committee helped us select our amazing 2019 Forum Fellows. So, let's take a moment to meet them. We have fellows, our ARL and DLF Fellows as well as our Students and New Professionals Fellows, our mid-career Focus Fellows and new this year, two international fellows. And we're also delighted to welcome three fellows through our GLAM cross-pollinator fellowship program and we also have other types of fellows with us and we are very thrilled to welcome our Authenticity Project fellows and mentors to the Forum this year. And you may remember if you attended the 2018 forum, we announced that that program was going to get underway and the Authenticity Project is hosted jointly by the HBCU library Alliance and DLF and it's an IMLS funded mentoring and professional development program for early to mid-career library staff from American, historically black colleges and universities. We are also happy to welcome our CLIR postdoc fellows to the Forum and this program offers recent PhD graduates the chance to develop research tools, resources, and services while exploring new career opportunities. So, all of these fellows, please stand as you're able, we'd love to

recognize you with another round of applause. So, all the fellows.

Aliya Reich: 01:12:58 We are so happy that you are here.

Aliya Reich: 01:13:02 And I would be remiss if I did not think the CLIR and DLF staff. I personally am so grateful to our staff. I know my name is up there, but everyone else on there who helps support conference planning amidst the changes in DLF over the last year, including Gayle Schechter, who is our new program associate who started only six weeks ago. So, talk about jumping into the deep end. You'll hear more from Gayle at the Lightning Talks tonight and the Closing Plenary. So, we're so excited to have her on staff, but thank you to all of the CLIR and DLF staff who helped make this event possible.